

AN ANALYSIS OF CLINICAL LEGAL EDUCATION IN INDIA: INITIATIVES IN HARYANA

By *Dr Anand Kumar** & *Ms. Uma Gupta***

* *Assistant Professor Department of Law, BPS Women University Sonipat Haryana, India*

** *Research Scholar Department of Law, BPS Women University Sonipat Haryana, India*

DOI: 10.55662/IJLDAI.2023.9601

ABSTRACT

Clinical legal education (CLE) is indeed a valuable teaching method in the field of law, as it bridges the gap between theoretical knowledge and practical application. This educational approach typically involves students engaging in real legal cases, offering them a hands-on experience that goes beyond traditional classroom learning. Clinical legal education is a dynamic and effective approach that prepares law students not only with the knowledge of the law but also with the practical skills, ethical values, and sense of responsibility needed to succeed in the legal profession. Haryana State Legal Service Authority has taken steps towards Clinical Legal Education.

Keywords: CLC, Education, Right, Practical training, Teaching method, Teaching-learning.

INTRODUCTION

Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan's in his education commission report emphasizes the importance of producing not just skilled lawyers but also great jurists who are socially responsible and contribute meaningfully to the goals of a liberal democratic state. It calls for a transformation in legal education and a commitment to societal development and justice.ⁱ

Clinical Legal Education is essential a multi-disciplined multipurpose education which can develop the human resources and idealism needed to strengthen the legal system,ⁱⁱ the statement underscores the versatility and importance of Clinical Legal Education in producing lawyers who are not only technically proficient but also ethically committed, socially aware, and capable of contributing meaningfully to the legal system, national development, and social change.

Clinical legal education aims to combine experiential learning with a commitment to social justice. It seeks to prepare students for the complexities of legal practice by exposing them to diverse situations, all while actively contributing to the well-being of individuals facing real legal challengesⁱⁱⁱ.

The historical overview sheds light on the rich legal traditions in India and the evolution of the legal education system. Which can be classified as follows?

a) **Historical Roots of Indian Legal System:**

- The legal history of India dates back to the Vedic ages, with a civil law system possibly in place during the Bronze Age and the Indus Valley civilization^{iv}.
- Legal principles were deeply rooted in religious prescriptions and philosophical discourse, with contributions from various philosophical schools, including Hindu, Jain, and Buddhist traditions.

b) **Secular Legal Systems in Ancient India^v:**

- Secular law in ancient India was diverse, varying from region to region and ruler to ruler.

- Ruling dynasties, such as the Mauryas, had well-established court systems for civil and criminal matters, with texts like Arthashastra defining law and Manusmriti defining royal duties.

c) Colonial Influence on Legal Profession^{vi}:

- The Mughal legal system had a significant impact on the legal profession in India.
- The shift from the Mughal legal system saw the emergence of advocates known as "vakils," who continued their role as client representatives.

d) Barriers to Entry in Supreme Courts:

- Initially, Indian practitioners faced restrictions in accessing the newly created Supreme Courts, where the right of audience was limited to members of English, Irish, and Scottish professional bodies.

e) Legal Practitioners Act of 1846^{vii}:

- The Legal Practitioners Act of 1846 played a pivotal role in opening up the legal profession in India. It removed restrictions based on nationality or religion, allowing wider participation.

f) Evolution of Legal Education:

- Traditionally, legal education in India was a three-year graduate degree, but the structure underwent a change in 1987.
- The Advocates Act, 1961^{viii}, passed by the Parliament, governs legal education and the regulation of the legal profession in India.

g) Role of Bar Council of India^{ix}:

- The Bar Council of India serves as the supreme regulatory body for legal professionals, overseeing legal education and professional conduct.
- It prescribes the minimum curriculum required for law degrees and conducts periodic supervision of institutions to ensure compliance with standards.

h) Regulation of Legal Profession:

- The Bar Council evaluates teaching methodologies, curricula, and institutional standards. Institutions meeting the required standards are recognized, and the degrees conferred by them are acknowledged.

The legal education system in India has a deep historical foundation, with influences from diverse philosophical and religious traditions. The evolution of the legal profession, including the removal of barriers and the establishment of regulatory frameworks, reflects the dynamic nature of legal education and practice in the country.

A. Object of the Study:- The Object of this research paper is to make a comparative analyses the clinical legal education and traditional legal education and what are the initiatives taken by the Educational institute to provide clinical legal education.

B. Review of Literature:-

Richard J. Wilson (2003)^x “Clinical legal education has also taken firm root outside the United States as well. In fact, as early as 1901 clinical legal education was proposed by a Russian professor, Alexander Lyublinsky, who believed that a law school clinical component could be modeled on medical training. This was sixteen years before the earliest proposals for clinics appeared in the United States. In some cases, particularly in Latin America and India during the late 1960s and early 1970s, law school clinics began operation at virtually the same time clinical education”

Sarker, S. P. (2015)^{xi} “The 1960s and 1970s were an important time in the history of legal education in India, a time when the legal aid movement and various legal aid committees’ reports started to draw attention to the importance of experiential learning, or learning on the job, in legal education. The main aim of involving law students in the national legal aid movement was to make them feel more responsible for the considerable part of the Indian population who, because of their socio-economic status, could not access justice. The history of how India’s clinical programs were introduced has a lot in common with the history of clinical programs in other parts of the world. There was a desire to create a pool of lawyers who would serve as soldiers in the fight for social justice for underprivileged groups in the country”^{xii}.

Sharma, N. (2017)^{xiii} “The most popular form of Government in the modern times is Democracy. The backbone of every democracy is its judicial system which is connected

with Legal Education. Thus, the bedrock of any judicial system is the imparting of right kind of legal education as it is from the law schools that the lawyers and the judges emerge”.

Bloch, F. S., & Prasad, M. R. K. (2006)^{xiv} The paper discusses the ongoing global debate among clinical law teachers regarding the future of social justice in clinical legal education, particularly as clinical programs increasingly focus on professional skills training. It highlights a unique opportunity in India to reconcile these potentially competing goals through a set of "Practical Papers" mandated by the Bar Council of India for all law schools in the country. Paper also explores the intersection of social justice and professional skills in clinical legal education, focusing on the Indian context and the Bar Council's Practical Papers as a potential means to integrate these goals. It also acknowledges the influence of the U.S. clinical movement on this development.

C. Drawback of Traditional legal education

While traditional legal education has its merits, there are several drawbacks associated with this conventional approach. Some of the key limitations include:

1. Emphasis on Theoretical Knowledge Over Practical Skills:

- Traditional legal education often places a heavy emphasis on theoretical concepts and case law analysis, sometimes at the expense of practical skills development.
- Graduates may find themselves lacking the hands-on experience necessary for the day-to-day challenges of legal practice.

2. Limited Exposure to Real-World Practice^{xv}:

- Classroom-based learning may not adequately expose students to the practical realities of legal practice, including client interactions, courtroom procedures, and the dynamics of legal negotiations.
- Lack of real-world exposure can result in a significant gap between academic knowledge and the skills needed in professional settings.

3. Inadequate Training in Client Management:

- Traditional legal education may not sufficiently address the interpersonal and client management skills required in legal practice.
- Lawyers often need to navigate client relationships, understand their needs, and communicate effectively, skills that may receive limited attention in a classroom setting.

4. Rigid Curriculum and Limited Specialization^{xvi}:

- The traditional legal education model often follows a rigid curriculum with limited room for specialization or exploration of emerging legal fields.
- As the legal landscape evolves, graduates may find themselves less equipped to address new and dynamic legal challenges.

5. Insufficient Focus on Practical Legal Ethics^{xvii}:

- While legal ethics is a crucial aspect of legal practice, traditional legal education may not provide enough practical scenarios to train students in ethical decision-making.
- Real-world ethical dilemmas may differ significantly from theoretical discussions in the classroom.

6. Lack of Interdisciplinary Learning:

- Legal issues often intersect with other disciplines such as business, technology, or psychology. Traditional legal education may not adequately promote interdisciplinary learning.
- Many legal challenges require a holistic understanding that extends beyond the boundaries of traditional legal knowledge.

7. Limited Technology Integration:

- Traditional legal education may lag in incorporating modern technologies and tools that are increasingly important in legal practice.

- Graduates may face challenges adapting to the technological aspects of legal research, case management, and communication.

8. **High Costs and Accessibility Issues:**

- Traditional legal education, particularly in prestigious institutions, can be costly and may limit accessibility for individuals from diverse socioeconomic backgrounds.
- High tuition fees and associated expenses may lead to significant student debt.

9. **Competitive Grading and Stress:**

- Traditional legal education often involves a competitive grading system, creating a high-stress environment among students.
- This competitive culture may prioritize grades over collaborative learning and personal development.

10. **Limited Emphasis on Practical Problem-Solving:**

- Traditional legal education may not sufficiently foster critical thinking and practical problem-solving skills.
- Graduates might find themselves unprepared to navigate the complexities of real-world legal challenges that require innovative solutions.

In response to these drawbacks, there has been a growing movement within legal education to integrate experiential learning, clinical programs, and practical skills training to better prepare law students for the demands of contemporary legal practice.

D. Purposes of Clinical Legal Education

The active and experiential nature of clinical legal education provides students with a unique set of opportunities that contribute significantly to their professional and intellectual development. It prepares them not only for the challenges of legal practice but also for a lifelong commitment to learning and growth in the legal field.

1. **Integration of Theory and Practice:** CLE allows students to apply legal theories and concepts in a real-world context. This integration is crucial for developing a comprehensive understanding of the law and its practical implications.
2. **Experiential Learning:** Through direct involvement in legal cases, students gain practical experience, enhancing their problem-solving skills and legal reasoning abilities. This experiential learning approach is an effective way to prepare students for the challenges they will face in their legal careers.
3. **Reflection and Critical Thinking:** CLE encourages students to reflect on their experiences, promoting critical thinking and self-awareness. This reflective process helps students identify strengths and areas for improvement, fostering continuous professional development.
4. **Skill Development:** Beyond theoretical knowledge, CLE focuses on the development of practical skills essential for legal practice. This may include legal research, client communication, negotiation, courtroom advocacy, and legal writing.
5. **Independence and Self-Reliance:** By handling real cases, students learn to work independently and develop self-reliance. This autonomy is crucial for building confidence and competence in future legal professionals.
6. **Ethical and Social Responsibility:** The emphasis on social, moral, and ethical values in CLE instills a sense of responsibility in students. It highlights the role of lawyers in serving the community and encourages ethical decision-making in legal practice.
7. **Motivation and Professionalism:** CLE motivates students by connecting them to the real-world impact of their work. This connection to the practical aspects of the law often reinforces a sense of professionalism and a commitment to making a positive difference in society.
8. **Community Engagement:** Through involvement in actual legal cases, students become actively engaged with the community. This connection helps students understand the broader societal implications of legal issues and encourages a commitment to community service.

9. **Client Interaction:** Clinical education often involves direct interaction with clients, providing students with the opportunity to develop crucial communication and interpersonal skills. Building relationships with clients helps students understand the human aspect of legal practice and fosters empathy and professionalism.
10. **Exposure to Diverse Legal Areas:** Clinical programs often cover a range of legal areas, exposing students to diverse practice areas and specialties. This exposure allows students to discover their interests and strengths, aiding in career exploration and decision-making.
11. **Preparation for Practice:** Perhaps most importantly, clinical education serves as a bridge between law school and legal practice. Graduates who have participated in clinical programs are often better prepared for the demands of the legal profession, having honed practical skills and gained insights into the day-to-day realities of legal work.

These skills collectively contribute to the holistic development of law students, preparing them for the multifaceted demands of legal practice. Additionally, the hands-on nature of clinical legal education ensures that students not only understand these skills theoretically but also gain practical experience in applying them to real cases.

It's worth noting that these skills are transferable and applicable to various legal specialties, allowing students to navigate diverse areas of law with competence and confidence. As students engage in clinical experiences, they have the opportunity to refine and hone these skills under the guidance of experienced practitioners, further enhancing their readiness for the legal profession.

E. Challenges faced in initiating Clinical Legal Education^{xviii}

Pursuant to orders of the Supreme Court dated June 29, 2009 and October 6, 2009 in case of Bar Council of India vs. Bonnie FOI Law College & Ors^{xix} a three member committee was constituted. The committee has submitted its report to the Bar Council of India. The committee has also submitted major issues posed to the legal education in India like:

- a) **Mandatory Clinical Legal Education:**

The Bar Council of India (BCI) has made clinical legal education mandatory in the curriculum. However, the report suggests that institutions are not showing sufficient interest in adopting the necessary skills associated with clinical legal education.

b) Financial Challenges:

Lack of funding is identified as a significant challenge in legal education. This financial constraint affects the infrastructure, payment to faculty, and technical requirements necessary for legal education.

c) Community Awareness:

There is a lack of awareness among communities regarding the provision of free legal services by law schools. This suggests a communication gap that needs to be addressed to ensure that communities are aware of the services provided by legal institutions.

d) Loopholes in Inspection and Recognition:

The report identifies loopholes in the inspection and recognition processes of law colleges by the Bar Council of India. This implies a need for improvements in the evaluation and accreditation mechanisms.

e) Separate Accreditation/ Rating System:

The committee proposes a separate accreditation or rating system for legal institutions. This suggests a recognition of the need for a specialized evaluation framework tailored to the unique requirements of legal education.

f) Restrictions on Full-Time Law Teachers and Students:

Under the Advocates Act, full-time law teachers and students are not allowed to represent clients before courts. This limitation may impact the practical exposure and real-world experience gained by students and faculty.

g) Insufficient Prominence to Practical Training:

Law schools are noted for not giving sufficient prominence to practical training for their students due to several problems. This implies a gap between theoretical knowledge and practical application.

h) Supervision and Assessment Challenges:

Difficulties in supervision and assessment are highlighted, indicating that overseeing students in clinical settings is a complex task that needs to be addressed.

The challenges identified by the committee underscore the multifaceted nature of issues in legal education, ranging from practical skills adoption, financial constraints, community awareness, inspection processes, accreditation systems, to limitations on the roles of full-time law teachers and students. Addressing these challenges is crucial for enhancing the quality and effectiveness of legal education in India.

F. Law Commission Report on Clinical Legal Education

The Law Commission's 184th Report in 2002 highlights significant changes and challenges in legal education in India. Some important key points derived from the mentioned content are summarized as follows:

a) Revolutionary Changes in Legal Education:

The report acknowledges revolutionary changes in legal education due to developments in various fields, including information, communication, transport technologies, intellectual property, corporate law, cyber law, human rights, ADR (Alternative Dispute Resolution), international business, comparative taxation laws, space laws, and environmental laws.

This suggests that legal education is adapting to and incorporating advancements in various legal domains.

b) Paradigm Shift in Legal Institutions and Practice:

The nature of law, legal institutions, and law practice is described as undergoing a paradigm shift. This implies a fundamental change or transformation in the core aspects of the legal field.

c) National Legal Services Schemes:

The introduction of national legal services schemes is noted as a positive development that has improved the climate for legal education in the country.

Students are described as active agents in delivering legal services to the poor, contributing to both the improvement of legal services and the enhancement of legal education.

d) Establishment of Legal Services Clinics:

Several Law Colleges have established Legal Services Clinics, both on and off the campus. These clinics play a crucial role in legal education by providing practical experiences to students.

Legal literacy and para-legal services are identified as key focuses of these clinics, indicating an emphasis on community outreach and service.

e) Involvement in Legal Literacy:

Law Colleges are actively involved in offering legal literacy programs in association with local Legal Services Authorities.

This suggests a commitment to promoting legal awareness and education beyond the academic setting, reaching out to the broader community.

In summary, the report highlights the dynamic nature of legal education in response to technological advancements and changes in the legal landscape. The involvement of students in delivering legal services to the underprivileged, the establishment of Legal Services Clinics, and the emphasis on legal literacy programs showcase a proactive approach to align legal education with the evolving needs of society.

G. National Legal Services Authority(Legal Services Clinics in Universities, Law Colleges and other Institutions) Scheme, 2013.

The NLSA drafted a comprehensive scheme for the establishment and functioning of Legal Services Clinics in universities, law colleges, and other institutions under Section 4(k) of the Legal Services Authorities Act, 1987. Some key points from the scheme are discussed below:

a) Mandate and Objectives:

Section 4(k) of the Legal Services Authorities Act, 1987 mandates the National Legal Services Authority to develop programs for clinical legal education and supervise the establishment of legal services clinics.

Objectives include improving students' clinical legal skills, instilling an attitude to provide elective legal services to the poor, and reaching out to marginalized communities.

b) Regulations and Applicability:

National Legal Services Authority (Legal Aid Clinics) Regulations, 2011 apply mutatis mutandis to student legal aid clinics.

Regulations 22 to 26 pertain to legal services clinics in law colleges and universities.

c) Setting up Legal Services Clinics:

Every university, law college, or institution is mandated to set up one or more Legal Services Clinics.

Off-campus legal services clinics may be established based on local needs.

Adequate publicity of clinic existence, location, and working hours is required.

d) Infrastructure Requirements:

Legal Services Clinics must have a furnished room for client counseling.

Workstations with computers and internet facilities for student research, case preparation, and legal aid literature.

Classrooms adjoining workstations for faculty guidance.

A people-friendly environment is encouraged.

e) Faculty and Guest Faculty:

Each clinic should have faculty members with special skills and interest in clinical legal education.

Part-time guest faculty, including experienced lawyers and retired judicial officers, may also be involved.

f) Activities of Legal Services Clinics:

Activities include client counseling, workshops for legal system functionaries, field surveys, street plays, and poster exhibitions on socio-legal issues.

Students may collaborate with para-legal volunteers and receive support from District Legal Services Authorities.

g) Social Justice Litigation:

Students identifying issues affecting large groups can file Social Justice Litigation with approval from concerned Legal Services Institutions.

h) Financial Support:

Universities, law colleges, and institutions must allocate funds in their annual budgets for Legal Services Clinics.

District Legal Services Authorities provide monthly funds, and clinics may also receive donations for infrastructural development.

i) Accounting and Auditing:

Proper accounting, auditing, and utilization certificates for funds received are required.

District Legal Services Authority has the power to inspect clinic accounts.

j) Record Maintenance:

Legal Services Clinics must maintain records, including student attendance, as required by regulations.

k) Staff and Infrastructural Support:

District Legal Services Authorities may provide staff, infrastructure, and necessary support for clinic functioning.

l) Reporting and Review:

District Legal Services Authority sends half-yearly reports to the State Legal Services Authority.

State Legal Services Authority conducts a half-yearly review, appreciating good work and awarding commendation certificates.

m) National Reporting:

State Legal Services Authority furnishes details of clinic activities to the National Legal Services Authority on a yearly basis.

This scheme outlines a structured approach to the establishment, operation, and oversight of Legal Services Clinics, emphasizing practical legal education, community engagement, and social justice initiatives.

H. Initiatives in Haryana for Effective Clinical Legal Education:

SR. NO.	NAME OF DISTRICT AUTHORITIES	SUPPORT CENTER IN THE OFFICES OF PROTECTION OFFICERS	JAIL	VILLAGE LEGAL CARE AND SUPPORT CENTRES I N GRAM PANCHAYATS	LEGAL CARE AND SUPPORT CENTRE IN PRIMARY HEALTH CENTERS/ URBAN AREAS/COMMUNITY CENTERS ETC.	LEGAL CARE AND SUPPORT CENTRES IN LAW COLLEGE	LEGAL CARE AND SUPPORT CENTRES IN DISTT. COURT	LEGAL CARE AND SUPPORT CENTRES IN J.J.B	LEGAL CARE AND SUPPORT CENTRES FOR THE PEOPLE OF NORTH-EAST (IN UNIVERSITIES)	LEGAL CARE AND SUPPORT CENTRES IN OBSERVATION HOME	TOTAL
01	AMBAL A	2	1	10	1	3	2	1		1	21
02	BHIWANI	1	1	21			3	1			27

03	CHARKHI DADRI			3			1				04
04	FARID ABAD	1	1	8	2	2	1	1	1	1	18
05	FATEH ABAD			24	1		3	1			29
06	GURUGRAM	2	1	9	3	1	3	1			20
07	HISSAR	2	2	13	6	5	1	1		1	31
08	JIND	1	1	17	2		1				22
09	JHAJJAR		1	12	3	1	1				18
10	KURUKSHETRA	1	1	17	7	2	2	1			31
11	KARNAL		1	26	4		1				32
12	KAITHAL	1	1	12	3	1	2	1			21
13	MEWAT ATNUH			6			2				08
14	NARN AUL	1	1	18	1	1	2	1			25
15	PALWAL	2	1	18			2	1			24
16	PANI PAT	2	1	15	4	1	1				24
17	PANCH KULA	1		13	5	1	2	1			23
18	ROHTAK	1	1	16		4	5	1			28
19	REW	1	1	12	7	2	2	1			26

	ARI										
20	SIRSA	1	1	23		3	2	1			31
21	SONE PAT	1	1	16	2	2	3	1	1		27
22	YA MU NA NAG AR		1	12	5		1	1			20
	TOTAL	21	19	321	56	29	43	16	2	3	510

Section 4(k) of the Legal Services Authority Act, 1987 mandates National Legal Services Authority to develop^{xx}, in consultation with the Bar Council of India, programmes for clinical legal education and to promote the guidance^{xxi} and supervision of the establishment of work of legal services clinics in Universities, Law Colleges and other institutions^{xxii}. As per Regulation 24 of the National Legal Services Authority (Legal Services Clinics) Regulation, 2011, it is obligatory on the part of the Law Colleges, Law Universities to set up Legal Service Clinics^{xxiii}. In consonance with the said statutory mandate, Haryana State Legal Services Authority (HLSA), which is a statutory body constituted under Legal Services Authorities Act, 1987 has proposed to establish Legal Service Clinics in all Law Colleges by re-defining the approach and ensuring greater involvement of law students by captivating young minds and by instilling service motto at the budding stage, not only the young law students will be benefitted,^{xxiv} but in the long run, the institution of Legal Services will achieve Excellency to cater to all the weaker and marginalized sections of the society^{xxv}.

Legal Care and Support Centres Established in the State of Haryana on 09-03-2018.^{xxvi}

Sr No.	Legal Care and Support Centers	Number
01	Support center in the Offices of Protection Officers	21
02	Jail	19
03	Village Legal care and Support centers in Gram Panchayats	321
04	Legal care and Support centers in Primary Health Centers/ Urban Areas/com- munity Centers etc.	56

05	Legal care and Support centers in Law College	29
06	Legal care and Support centers In Distt. Court	43
07	Legal care and support centers in J.J.B	16
08	Legal care and support centers for the people of north-east (in universities)	02
09	Legal Care and support centers in observation home	03
	Total	510

So there are 510 Legal Care and Support centers Established in the State of Haryana where Law students can participate as Para Legal Volunteers (PLV).

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the combination of learning from experienced practitioners, exposure to diverse legal work, and the guidance provided by mentors contributes significantly to the holistic development of law students. Practical experience not only prepares students for the challenges of the legal profession but also instills the qualities and skills essential for success in their future careers.

The acknowledgment of Clinical Legal Education (CLE) as an effective and sustainable solution to the access to justice issues in Southeast Asia reflects a recognition of the dual challenges faced by marginalized and disadvantaged groups and the shortcomings of the traditional legal education system. Here are some key points derived from your statement:

a) Addressing the Injustice Faced by Marginalized Groups:

CLE is seen as a solution to the problem of injustice faced by marginalized and disadvantaged groups. These groups often lack legal knowledge, understanding, or financial means to access the law and defend their rights.

The result is a growing societal rift between those with financial and legal means and those without, contributing to a sense of injustice.

b) Traditional Legal Education's Limitations:

The traditional method of teaching law in Southeast Asia is criticized for its inability to make students aware of challenges related to social justice and access to justice.

It is highlighted that the traditional legal education system does not equip law graduates with the necessary legal skills, knowledge, and values needed to effectively address and solve issues related to social justice and access to justice.

c) Role of Clinical Legal Education (CLE):

CLE is presented as a solution that goes beyond the limitations of traditional legal education.

By engaging students in real-life legal cases and practical experiences, CLE aims to bridge the gap between theoretical knowledge and practical application, ensuring that law graduates are better equipped to understand and address issues of social justice and access to justice.

d) Empowering Law Graduates with Practical Skills and Values:

CLE is expected to produce law graduates who possess not only theoretical legal knowledge but also practical skills and values essential for solving real-world legal problems.

The emphasis on values suggests a commitment to instilling ethical considerations and a sense of responsibility in law graduates.

e) Promoting Sustainable Solutions:

The use of the term "sustainable solution" implies that CLE is not just a temporary fix but a long-term approach to improving access to justice in Southeast Asia.

By incorporating practical experiences into legal education, CLE aims to create a sustainable impact on the legal profession, ensuring that future lawyers are better equipped to address societal challenges.

In conclusion, we can say that, the transformative potential of Clinical Legal Education in addressing the root causes of injustice and inequity in Southeast Asia. By providing students with practical experiences and a deeper understanding of social justice issues, CLE contributes to the development of a more capable and socially conscious legal workforce.

SUGGESTIONS

1. Adaptation to Society's Changing Needs:

Legal education should evolve to meet the changing needs of society. This implies a requirement for a curriculum that is responsive to the evolving nature of legal practice and societal expectations.

2. Identification and Correction of Deficiencies:

Before legal education becomes inaccessible to competent individuals, it is essential to identify and rectify any deficiencies in the system.

A proactive approach is necessary to address shortcomings in the curriculum, teaching methodologies, and overall structure of legal education.

3. Impact on Student Growth and Development:

Concerns about the current state of legal education suggest that students' growth and development may be hindered by existing challenges.

This highlights the need for a student-centric approach that fosters not only academic knowledge but also practical skills and professional development.

4. Need for Practical Approaches:

Moot courts, while valuable, are highlighted as insufficient in meeting the demands of modern legal practice.

There is a call for a more practical approach to be incorporated into the curriculum, suggesting a shift towards experiential learning and hands-on training.

5. Development of Clinical Work Skills:

Law professors should focus on developing clinical work skills to improve the implementation of effective legal education.

6. Bar Council Rules for Law Professors:

The Bar Council of India should formulate rules allowing law professors to practice while teaching clinical classes. Law schools should be encouraged to appoint faculty with clinical work skills, and students should be offered credits for participating in clinics.

7. Collaboration with NGOs:

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) should collaborate with law schools to advance social justice.

8. Broadening Legal Aid Scope:

Legal services authorities should expand the scope of legal aid by supporting law schools and making legal aid easily accessible within the premises of law schools.

9. Funding for Clinical Legal Education:

Adequate funds should be made available to encourage clinical legal education, contributing to strengthening democracy, improving governance, advancing justice, and upholding the rule of law.

10. Public Awareness:

More awareness about legal aid and clinical legal education should be spread in society. Information related to legal aid should be available in vernacular languages to make justice more accessible to ordinary people.

11. Recognition of Clinical Legal Education:

Clinics should be given further recognition for para-legal services such as legal opinions, drafting applications, and pursuing alumni-based representations. Recognize clinical legal education as credit-based and mandatory, reflecting the academic performance of students.

ENDNOTES

ⁱ Law Minister Virappa Moily on National Consultation for 'Second Generation Reforms in Legal Education' at Vigyan Bhavan. New Delhi on 2 May, 2010.

ⁱⁱ Kuljit Kaur, "Legal Education and Social Transformation" available at: <http://alsonline.amity.edu/Docs/>

alwjlegkk.pdf. (last visited on 12.03.2023)

ⁱⁱⁱ Frank Bloch & M.R.K. Prasad, Institutionalizing a Social Justice Mission for Clinical Legal Education: Cross-National Currents from India and the United States, 13 *Clinical L. Rev.* 165 (2006). 7. *Ibid*, 172.

^{iv} Available at <http://www.barcouncilofindia.org/about/about-the-legal-profession/legal-education-in-the-united-kingdom/>

^v *Ibid*

^{vi} *Ibid*.

^{vii} Available at https://www.indiacode.nic.in/repealed-act/repealed_act_documents/A1846-1.pdf.

^{viii} Available at, https://www.indiacode.nic.in/bitstream/123456789/1631/1/A1961_25.pdf.

^{ix} Available at , <http://www.barcouncilofindia.org/about/about-the-bar-council-of-india>.

^x Wilson, R. J. (2003). Training for justice: The global reach of clinical legal education. *Penn St. Int'l L. Rev.*, 22, 421. Available at

<https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/psilr22&div=29&id=&page=>

^{xi} Sarker, S. P. (2015). Empowering the underprivileged: The social justice mission for clinical legal education in India. In *Clinical Legal Education in Asia: Accessing Justice for the Underprivileged* (pp. 177-193). New York: Palgrave Macmillan US. Available at https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/9781137517531_10

^{xii} *Ibid*.

^{xiii} Sharma, N. (2017). Clinical Legal Education in India: A contemporary legal pedagogy. *Indian JL & Just.*, 8, 165. Available at <https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/ijlj8&div=19&id=&page=>

^{xiv} Bloch, F. S., & Prasad, M. R. K. (2006). Institutionalizing a social justice mission for clinical legal education: Cross-national currents from India and the United States. *Clinical L. Rev.*, 13, 165. Available at <https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/clinic13&div=9&id=&page=>

^{xv} Available at, <https://blog.ipleaders.in/mismanagement-of-legal-education-in-india/>.

^{xvi} Available at, <https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/indian-legal-education-crossroads-bhumesh-verma?>

^{xvii} *Ibid*.

^{xviii} Available at <https://www.cmr.edu.in/school-of-legal-studies/journal/wp-content/uploads/2022/11/AN-ANALYSIS-OF-CLINICAL-LEGAL-EDUCATION-IN-INDIA-INITIATIVES-IN-KARNATAKA.pdf>

^{xix} S.L.P. (C) No. 22337 of 2008

^{xx} Available at <https://kslsa.kar.nic.in/pdfs/notifications/SOPLSC.pdf>.

^{xxi} Available at <https://docplayer.net/234158772-An-analysis-of-clinical-legal-education-in-india-initiatives-in-karnataka.html>.

^{xxii} Available at <https://kslsa.kar.nic.in/pdfs/notifications/SOPLSC.pdf>.

^{xxiii} Available at <https://kslsa.kar.nic.in/pdfs/notifications/SOPLSC.pdf>

^{xxiv} Available at <https://docplayer.net/234158772-An-analysis-of-clinical-legal-education-in-india-initiatives-in-karnataka.html>.

^{xxv} Available at <https://kslsa.kar.nic.in/pdfs/notifications/SOPLSC.pdf>.

^{xxvi} Available at

<https://cdnbbsr.s3waas.gov.in/s3100d9f30ca54b18d14821dc88fea0631/uploads/2022/06/2022062791.pdf>